# Stable Roommates and Constraint Programming

Patrick Prosser

School of Computing Science, University of Glasgow, pat@dcs.gla.ac.uk



Something like stable marriage problem ... but without sex.



- Men rank women,
- Women rank men
- Match men to women in a matching M such that there is no incentive for a (m,w) pair not in M to divorce and elope
- i.e. it is *stable*, there are *no blocking pairs*



- Men rank women,
- Women rank men
- Match men to women in a matching M such that there is no incentive for a (m,w) pair not in M to divorce and elope
- i.e. it is *stable*, there are *no blocking pairs*



- Men rank women,
- Women rank men
- Match men to women in a matching M such that there is no incentive for a (m,w) pair not in M to divorce and elope
- i.e. it is *stable*, there are *no blocking pairs*



- Men rank women,
- Women rank men
- Match men to women in a matching M such that there is no incentive for a (m,w) pair not in M to divorce and elope
- i.e. it is *stable*, there are *no blocking pairs*

In the Stable Roommates problem (SR) [8, 7] we have an even number of agents to be matched together as couples, where each agent strictly ranks all other agents. The problem is then to match pairs of agents together such that the matching is stable, i.e. there doesn't exist a pair of agents in the matching such that  $agent_i$  prefers  $agent_j$  to his matched partner and  $agent_j$  prefers  $agent_i$  to his matched partner<sup>1</sup>. In the Stable Roommates problem (SR) [8, 7] we have an even number of agents to be matched together as couples, where each agent strictly ranks all other agents. The problem is then to match pairs of agents together such that the matching is stable, i.e. there doesn't exist a pair of agents in the matching such that  $agent_i$  prefers  $agent_j$  to his matched partner and  $agent_j$  prefers  $agent_i$  to his matched partner<sup>1</sup>.



Order n squared (Knuth thought not) JOURNAL OF ALGORITHMS 6, 577-595 (1985)

#### An Efficient Algorithm for the "Stable Roommates" Problem

**ROBERT W. IRVING\*** 

Department of Mathematics, University of Salford, Salford M5 4WT, United Kingdom

#### Received January 31, 1984; accepted May 1, 1984

The stable matriage problem is that of matching n men and n women, each of whom has ranked the members of the opposite sex in order of preference, so that no unmatched couple both prefer each other to their partners under the matching. At least one stable matching exists for every stable matriage instance, and efficient algorithms for finding such a matching are well known. The stable roommates problem involves a single set of even cardinality n, each member of which ranks all the others in order of preference. A stable matching is now a partition of this single set into n/2 pairs so that no two unmatched members both prefer each other to their partners under the matching. In this case, there are problem instances for which no stable matching exists. However, the present paper describes an  $O(n^2)$  algorithm that will determine, for any instance of the problem, whether a stable matching exists, and if so, will find such a matching. e 1985 Academic Press, Inc.

#### 1. INTRODUCTION AND HISTORY

#### The Stable Marriage Problem

The stable marriage assignment problem was introduced by Gale and Shapley [1] in the context of assigning applicants to colleges, taking into account the preferences of both the applicants and the colleges.

In its most familiar form, a problem instance involves two disjoint sets of cardinality n, the men and the women, with each individual having ranked the n members of the opposite sex in order of preference. A stable matching is defined as a one-to-one correspondence between the men and women with the property that there is no couple both of whom prefer each other to their actual partners.

Gale and Shapley demonstrated that at least one stable matching exists for every problem instance, and described an algorithm that would yield one such solution. McVitic and Wilson [4] proposed an alternative recursive

\*Present address: Department of Computer Science, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QQ, United Kingdom.

577

0196-6774/85 \$3.00 Copyright © 1985 by Academic Press, Inc. All rights of reproduction in any form reserved.



# Order n squared (Rob thought so)

Foundations of Computing Series

#### **The Stable Marriage Problem** Structure and Algorithms

Dan Gusfield and Robert W. Irving



The MIT Press

The green book

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

Taken from "The green book"

10 agents, each ranks 9 others, gender-free (n=10, n should be even)

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

(1,7)	(2,3)	(4,9)	(5, 10)	(6,8)
(1,7)	(2,8)	(3,5)	(4,9)	(6,10)
(1,7)	(2,8)	(3,6)	(4,9)	(5,10)
(1,4)	(2,8)	(3,6)	(5,7)	(9,10)
(1,4)	(2,9)	(3,6)	(5,7)	(8,10)
(1,4)	(2,3)	(5,7)	(6,8)	(9,10)
(1,3)	(2,4)	(5,7)	(6,8)	(9,10)

#### 7 stable matchings

Taken from "The green book"

# 1985



#### What's the problem?

# Code

# 1985



#### What's the problem?

# Code



#### What's the problem?



## What's the problem?



#### What's the problem?



#### What's the problem?



# Stephan & Ciaran spotted something!



A simple constraint model

A simple constraint model

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

 $pref_i$ 

Preference list for agent i

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

pref <sub>i</sub>	Preference list for agent i
$pref_{i,k} = j$	agent j is agent i's kth choice

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

 $pref_3 = 5,6,8,2,1,7,10,4,9$ 

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

 $pref_{3,5} = 1$  The 5<sup>th</sup> preference of agent 3 is agent 1

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

 $pref_{i,k} = j$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

 $rank_{i,j} = k$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

pref <sub>i</sub>	Preference list for agent i
-------------------	-----------------------------

- $pref_{i,k} = j$  agent j is agent i's kth choice
- $rank_{i,j} = k$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

NOTE: a rank value that is low is a preferred choice (large numbers are bad)

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3&5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

 $pref_{i,k} = j$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

 $rank_{3,5} = 1$  agent 5 is agent 3's 1st choice

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

- $pref_{i,k} = j$  agent j is agent i's kth choice
- $rank_{3,5} = 1$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

 $a_i \in \{1..n-1\}$  constrained integer variable agent i with a domain of ranks

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

*pref*<sub>i</sub> Preference list for agent i

- $pref_{i,k} = j$  agent j is agent i's kth choice
- $rank_{3,5} = 1$  agent j is agent i's kth choice

$a_7$	=	6
		<u> </u>

agent 7 gets 6<sup>th</sup> choice and that is agent 10

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \ a_i \in \{1..l_i + 1\} \tag{1}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i > rank_{i,j} \implies a_j < rank_{j,i} \tag{2}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i = rank_{i,j} \implies a_j = rank_{j,i} \tag{3}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \ a_i \in \{1..l_i + 1\} \tag{1}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i > rank_{i,j} \implies a_j < rank_{j,i} \tag{2}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i = rank_{i,j} \implies a_j = rank_{j,i} \tag{3}$$

(1) agent variables, actually we allow incomplete lists!

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \ a_i \in \{1..l_i + 1\} \tag{1}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i > rank_{i,j} \implies a_j < rank_{j,i} \tag{2}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i = rank_{i,j} \implies a_j = rank_{j,i} \tag{3}$$

- (1) agent variables, actually we allow incomplete lists!
- (2) If agent i is matched to agent he prefers less than agent j then agent j must match with someone better than agent i

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \ a_i \in \{1..l_i + 1\} \tag{1}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i > rank_{i,j} \implies a_j < rank_{j,i} \tag{2}$$

$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i = rank_{i,j} \implies a_j = rank_{j,i} \tag{3}$$

- (1) agent variables, actually we allow incomplete lists!
- (2) If agent i is matched to agent he prefers less than agent j then agent j must match with someone better than agent i
- (3) If agent i is matched to agent j then agent j is matched to agent i

<u>Given</u> two agents, 1 and 3, <u>if</u> agent 1 is matched to an agent he prefers less than agent 3 <u>then</u> agent 3 must match with an agent he prefers to agent 1



$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i > rank_{i,j} \implies a_j < rank_{j,i} \tag{2}$$

 $\begin{array}{c}1:8&2&9&3&6&4&5&7&10\\2:4&3&8&9&5&1&10&6&7\\3:5&6&8&2&1&7&10&4&9\\4:10&7&9&3&1&6&2&5&8\\5:7&4&10&8&2&6&3&1&9\\6:2&8&7&3&4&10&1&5&9\\7:2&1&8&3&5&10&4&6&9\\8:10&4&2&5&6&7&1&3&9\\9:6&7&2&5&10&3&4&8&1\\10:3&1&6&5&2&9&8&4&7\end{array}$ 

<u>Given</u> two agents, 1 and 3, <u>if</u> agent 1 is matched to agent 3 <u>then</u> agent 3 is matched to agent 1



$$\forall_{i \in [1..n]} \forall_{j \in pref_i} \ a_i = rank_{i,j} \implies a_j = rank_{j,i} \tag{3}$$

```
choco
public class StableRoommates {
  public static void main(String[] args) throws IOException {
     BufferedReader fin = new BufferedReader(new FileReader(args [0]);
     int n = Integer.parseInt(fin.readLine());
     int[][] pref = new int[n][n];
     int[][] rank = new int[n][n];
     int[] length = new int[n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++){
         StringTokenizer st = new StringTokenizer(fin.readLine(),"");
         int k = 0:
         length[i] = 0;
         while (st.hasMoreTokens()){
             int j = Integer.parseInt(st.nextToken()) - 1;
             rank[i][j] = k;
             pref[i][k] = j;
             length[i] = length[i] + 1;
             k = k + 1:
         rank[i][i] = k;
         pref[i][k] = i;
     fin.close();
     Model model = new CPModel();
     IntegerVariable [] a = new IntegerVariable [n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++) a[i] = makeIntVar("a_"+ i, 0, length[i], "cp:enum");
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         for (int j=0; j < length[i]; j++)
             int k = pref[i][j];
             model.addConstraint(implies(gt(a[i],rank[i][k]),lt(a[k],rank[k][i])));
             model.addConstraint(implies(eq(a[i],rank[i][k]),eq(a[k],rank[k][i])));
     Solver solver = new CPSolver();
     solver.read(model);
     if (solver.solve().booleanValue())
       for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
          int j = pref[i][solver.getVar(a[i]).getVal()];
          if (i<j) System.out.print("("+ (i+1) +","+ (i+1) +")");</p>
     System.out.println();
```

 $^{2}_{3}$ 

4 5

6

 $\overline{7}$ 

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20 21

22

23

 $\frac{24}{25}$ 

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33 34

35

36 37

38 39

 $\frac{40}{41}$ 

 $\frac{42}{43}$ 

```
choco
public class StableRoommates {
  public static void main(String] args) throws IOException {
     BufferedReader fin = new BufferedReader(new FileReader(args [0]);
     int n = Integer.parseInt(fin.readLine());
     int[][] pref = new int[n][n];
     int[][] rank = new int[n][n];
     int[] length = new int[n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         StringTokenizer st = new StringTokenizer(fin.readLine(),"");
         int k = 0:
         length[i] = 0;
         while (st.hasMoreTokens()){
             int j = Integer.parseInt(st.nextToken()) - 1;
             rank[i][j] = k;
             pref[i][k] = j;
             length[i] = length[i] + 1;
             k = k + 1:
         rank[i][i] = k;
         pref[i][k] = i;
                                                     Read in the problem
     fin.close();
     Model model = new CPModel();
     IntegerVariable [] a = new IntegerVariable [n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++) a[i] = makeIntVar("a_"+ i, 0, length[i], "cp:enum");
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         for (int j=0; j < length[i]; j++)
             int k = pref[i][j];
             model.addConstraint(implies(gt(a[i],rank[i][k]),lt(a[k],rank[k][i])));
             model.addConstraint(implies(eq(a[i],rank[i][k]),eq(a[k],rank[k][i])));
     Solver solver = new CPSolver();
     solver.read(model);
     if (solver.solve().booleanValue())
       for (int i=0; i < n; i++){
          int j = pref[i][solver.getVar(a[i]).getVal()];
          if (i<j) System.out.print("("+ (i+1) +","+ (i+1) +")");</p>
     System.out.println();
```

4 5

6

 $\overline{7}$ 

8

9

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17 18

19 20 21

22

 $\frac{23}{24}$ 

25

26 27

28

29

30

31

32 33 34

35

36 37

38 39

 $\frac{40}{41}$ 

 $\frac{42}{43}$ 

```
choco
public class StableRoommates {
 public static void main(String] args) throws IOException {
     BufferedReader fin = new BufferedReader(new FileReader(args [0]);
     int n = Integer.parseInt(fin.readLine());
     int[][] pref = new int[n][n];
     int[][] rank = new int[n][n];
     int[] length = new int[n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++){
         StringTokenizer st = new StringTokenizer(fin.readLine(),"");
         int k = 0:
         length[i] = 0;
         while (st.hasMoreTokens()){
             int j = Integer.parseInt(st.nextToken()) - 1;
             rank[i][j] = k;
             pref[i][k] = j;
             length[i] = length[i] + 1;
             k = k + 1:
         rank[i][i] = k;
         pref[i][k] = i;
     Model model = new CPModel();
     IntegerVariable [] a = new IntegerVariable [n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++) a[i] = makeIntVar("a_"+ i, 0, length[i], "cp:enum");
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         for (int j=0; j < length[i]; j++)
             int k = pref[i][j];
             model.addConstraint(implies(gt(a[i],rank[i][k]),lt(a[k],rank[k][i])));
             model.addConstraint(implies(eq(a[i],rank[i][k]),eq(a[k],rank[k][i]));
                                                                    Build the model
     Solver solver = new CPSolver();
     solver.read(model);
     if (solver.solve().booleanValue())
       for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
          int j = pref[i][solver.getVar(a[i]).getVal()];
          if (i<j) System.out.print("("+ (i+1) +","+ (j+1) +")");
     System.out.println();
```

4 5

6

 $\overline{7}$ 

8

9

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19 20 21

22

23 24 25

26 27

28

29

30

31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38 39

 $\frac{40}{41}$ 

 $\frac{42}{43}$ 

```
choco
public class StableRoommates {
 public static void main(String] args) throws IOException {
     BufferedReader fin = new BufferedReader(new FileReader(args[0]);
     int n = Integer.parseInt(fin.readLine());
     int[][] pref = new int[n][n];
     int[][] rank = new int[n][n];
     int[] length = new int[n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         StringTokenizer st = new StringTokenizer(fin.readLine(),"");
         int k = 0;
         length[i] = 0;
         while (st.hasMoreTokens()){
             int j = Integer.parseInt(st.nextToken()) - 1;
             rank[i][j] = k;
             pref[i][k] = j;
             length[i] = length[i] + 1;
             k = k + 1:
         ł
         rank[i][i] = k;
         pref[i][k] = i:
     fin.close();
     Model model = new CPModel();
     IntegerVariable [] a = new IntegerVariable [n];
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++) a[i] = makeIntVar("a_"+ i, 0, length[i], "cp:enum");
     for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
         for (int j=0; j<length[i]; j++){
             int k = pref[i][j];
             model.addConstraint(implies(gt(a[i],rank[i][k]),lt(a[k],rank[k][i])));
             model.addConstraint(implies(eq(a[i], rank[i][k]), eq(a[k], rank[k][i]));
                                                 Find and print first matching
     Solver solver = new CPSolver();
     if (solver.solve().booleanValue())
       for (int i=0; i < n; i++)
          int j = pref[i][solver.getVar(a[i]).getVal()];
          if (i<j) System.out.print("("+ (i+1) +","+ (j+1) +")");
     System.out.println();
```

 $^{4}$ 

 $\frac{5}{6}$ 

 $\overline{7}$ 

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17 18

19

20

21

22 23 24

25

26

27

28

29 30

31 32

33

34

35

 $\frac{36}{37}$ 

38

39 40 41

 $\frac{42}{43}$ 



## Ant: Bea, Ann, Cat

Bob: Bea, Cat, Ann

Cal: Ann, Bea, Cat

Ann: Bob, Ant, Cal

Bea: Cal, Ant, Bob

Cat: Cal, Bob, Ant

#### SM

. . . . . . . . .

men			women												
1	:	1	3	6	$\hat{2}$	4	5	1	;	1	$\overline{5}$	6	3	$\overline{2}$	4
<b>2</b>	1	4	6	1	<b>2</b>	5	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	÷	<b>2</b>	4	6	1	<b>3</b>	5
<b>3</b>	1	1	<b>4</b>	5	<b>3</b>	6	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	:	4	<b>3</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	5	1
4	:	<b>6</b>	5	<b>3</b>	4	<b>2</b>	1	4	:	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	5	4	<b>2</b>	6
5	1	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	1	4	<b>5</b>	6	5	÷	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	6	1	4	<b>5</b>
6	1	<b>3</b>	1	<b>2</b>	6	5	4	6	:	5	1	<b>3</b>	6	<b>4</b>	<b>2</b>

### SRI

#### women+6

 $\begin{array}{c}1: \mathbf{7} \ 9 \ 12 \ 8 \ 10 \ 11 \\2: 10 \ 12 \ \mathbf{7} \ \mathbf{8} \ 11 \ 9 \\3: \mathbf{7} \ \mathbf{10} \ 11 \ 9 \ 12 \ 8 \\4: \mathbf{12} \ 11 \ 9 \ 10 \ 8 \ 7 \\5: 8 \ 9 \ \mathbf{7} \ 10 \ \mathbf{11} \ 12 \\6: \mathbf{9} \ \mathbf{7} \ 8 \ 12 \ 11 \ 10 \\7: \mathbf{1} \ 5 \ 6 \ 3 \ 2 \ 4 \\8: \mathbf{2} \ 4 \ 6 \ 1 \ 3 \ 5 \\9: 4 \ 3 \ 6 \ 2 \ 5 \ 1 \\10 \ 1 \ \mathbf{3} \ 5 \ 4 \ 2 \ 6 \\11 \ 3 \ 2 \ 6 \ 1 \ 4 \ 5 \\12 \ 5 \ 1 \ 3 \ 6 \ 4 \ 2 \end{array}$ 

Yes, but what's new here?





- 1. Model appeared twice in workshops
- Applied to SM but not SR! (two sets of variables, more complicated)
- 3. One model for SM, SMI, SR & SRI
- 4. Simple & elegant



1. Model appeared twice in workshops

- 2. Applied to SM but not SR! (two sets of variables, more complicated)
- 3. One model for SM, SMI, SR & SRI
- 4. Simple & elegant

But this is hard to believe ... it is *slower* than Rob's 1985 results!



1. Model appeared twice in workshops

- 2. Applied to SM but not SR! (two sets of variables, more complicated)
- 3. One model for SM, SMI, SR & SRI
- 4. Simple & elegant



But this is hard to believe ... it is *slower* than Rob's 1985 results!

Cubic to achieve *phase-1 table* 

Not so neat



# When an agent's domain is filtered AC revises all constraints that involve that variable.





I implemented a specialised binary SR constraint and an n-ary SR constraint This deals with incomplete lists This is presented in the paper You can also download and run this

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
   private int n;
   private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
   private int[] length;
   private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
   private IntDomainVar [] a;
   public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
                    = a.length;
        n
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
       this.rank
                   = rank;
        this.length = length;
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        uph
       lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb i = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
   public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
   public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
   public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException
       int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
       int j = pref[1][x];
       a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
   3
   public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
       int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
       for (int y=x+1;y<=upb[i].get();y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][1]);
       upb[i].set(x);
   3
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
   public void awakeOnInst(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref i [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
       lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

4

57

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 

31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42

 $\frac{43}{44}$ 

45

46

47

48

49

50 51

52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

Here's the code. Not much to it ©

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
    private int n;
    private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
    private int[] length;
    private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
    private IntDomainVar[] a;
    public SRN(Solver s, IntDomainVar[] a, Int[][] pref, Int[][] rank, Int[] length)
        super(a);
                     = a.length;
        n
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
        this.rank
                    = rank;
        this.length = length;
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        uph
        lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb i = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
    public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
    public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
    public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException -
        int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
        for (int y=x+1; y \le upb[i].get(); y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
        upb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
    public void awakeOnInst(int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get();x<y;x++){
    int j = pref[i][x];</pre>
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
        lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

4

5

6 7

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42

 $\frac{43}{44}$ 

45

 $\frac{46}{47}$ 

48

49 50

51

52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

Constructor

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
    private int n;
    private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
    private int[] length;
    private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
    private IntDomainVar [] a;
    public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
        n
                    = a.length;
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
        this.rank
                   = rank;
        this.length = length;
        uph
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
    public void awake() throws ContradictionException
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
    public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
    public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException
        int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
        for (int y=x+1;y<=upb[i].get();y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
        upb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
    public void awakeOnInst(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref [i] [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
        lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

4

6 7

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42

 $\frac{43}{44}$ 

45

46

47

48

49 50

51

52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

## awakening

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
   private int n;
   private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
   private int[] length;
   private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
   private IntDomainVar [] a;
   public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
                    = a.length;
        n
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
       this.rank
                   = rank;
        this.length = length;
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        uph
       lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb i = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
   public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
   public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
   public void awakeOnInf(int i) throws ContradictionException
       int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[1][x]
       a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][1]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
   public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
       int x = a[1].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
        for (int y=x+1;y<=upb[i].get();y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
       upb[i].set(x);
   3
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
   public void awakeOnInst(int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref i [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
       lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

-4

6 7

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40 41

42 43 44

45

46

47

48

49

50 51

52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

#### lower bound changes

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
   private int n;
   private int[][] rank;
    private int [][] pref;
   private int[] length;
   private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
   private IntDomainVar [] a;
   public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
                    = a.length;
        n
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
        this.rank
                   = rank;
       this.length = length;
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        uph
       lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
       for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb i = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
   public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
   public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
   public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException -
       int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[i][x];
       a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
   public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
       int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
       for (int y=x+1;y<=upb[i].get();y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][1]);
       upb[i].set(x);
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
   public void awakeOnInst(int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref i [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
       lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

-4

57

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42 43 44

45

46

47

48

49 50

51 52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

### upper bound changes

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
    private int n;
    private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
    private int[] length;
    private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
    private IntDomainVar [] a;
    public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
                    = a.length;
        n
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
        this.rank
                   = rank;
        this.length = length;
        uph
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb [i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
    public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
    public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
    public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException -
        int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[1][x];
        a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
        for (int y=x+1; y \le upb[i].get(); y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
        upb[i].set(x);
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
    public void awakeOnInst(int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i] \cdot getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref [i] [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
        lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

-4

6 7

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42

 $\frac{43}{44}$ 

45

 $\frac{46}{47}$ 

48

49 50

51 52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

### removal of a value

```
public class SRN extends AbstractLargeIntSConstraint {
    private int n;
    private int[][] rank;
    private int [] pref;
    private int[] length;
    private IStateInt ] upb;
private IStateInt ] lwb;
    private IntDomainVar [] a;
    public SRN(Solver s,IntDomainVar[] a,Int[][] pref,Int[][] rank,Int[] length) {
        super(a);
        n
                    = a.length;
        this.a
                    = a;
        this.pref
                    = pref;
        this.rank
                   = rank;
        this.length = length;
        uph
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        lwb
                    = new StoredInt[n];
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++){
            upb[i] = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(length[i]);
            lwb i = s.getEnvironment().makeInt(0);
    public void awake() throws ContradictionException {
        for (int i=0;i<n;i++) awakeOnInf(i);
    public void propagate() throws ContradictionException {}
    public void awakeOnInf(Int i) throws ContradictionException -
        int x = a[i].getInf(); // best (lowest) rank for a i
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]);
        for (int w=lwb[i].get();w<x;w++){
            int h = pref[i][w];
            a[h].setSup(rank[h][i]-1);
        fwb[i].set(x);
    3
    public void awakeOnSup(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int x = a[i].getSup(); // worst (largest) preference for a[i]
        for (int y=x+1;y<=upb[i].get();y++){
            int j = pref[i][y];
            a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
        upb[i].set(x);
    з
    public void awakeOnRem(int i, int x) throws ContradictionException {
        int j = pref[i][x];
        a[j].remVal(rank[j][i]);
    public void awakeOnInst(Int i) throws ContradictionException {
        int y = a[i].getVal();
        for (int x = lwb[i].get(); x < y; x++){
            int j = pref i [x]
            a[j].setSup(rank[j][i]-1);
        for (int z=y+1;z<=upb[i].get();z++){
            int j = pref[i][z]
            a [j].remVal(rank [j][1]);
        lwb[i].set(y);
        upb[i].set(y);
```

3

4

5

6 7

8 9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

27

28

 $\frac{29}{30}$ 31

32 33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40 41

42

 $\frac{43}{44}$ 

45

46

47

48

49 50

51

52 53

5.4

55

56 57 58

59

60

61 62

63 64

65

66

67

68 69

70 71

# A specialised constraint

# instantiate



Home Personal Publications Research Activities Teaching People Links Family Downloads

# Downloads

Code and applications are covered by the <u>CRAPL licence</u>

Ξ

- exact algorithms for maximum clique
- constraint encoding for problem in extremal graph theory
- · constraint encoding for stable roommates problem

Copyright @ Patrick Prosser 2013.

<u></u>	Index of /~pat/roommates/dis	+							X
¢	www.dcs.gla.ac.uk/~pat/room	nmates/distribution/			٩	☆自	+	⋒	Ξ
Iı	ndex of /~pat/1	roommates/	dist	ribution					
	Name	Last modified	<u>Size</u>	Description					
2	Parent Directory		-						
	CRAPL-LICENSE.txt	06-Aug-2013 16:56	4.0K						
	choco/	06-Aug-2013 16:54	-						
	code20130815/	06-Aug-2013 16:54	-						
	code20131018/	16-Oct-2013 10:33	-						
	data/	16-Oct-2013 10:36	-						
1	distribution.zip	14-Nov-2013 09:50	22M						
	papers/	21-Nov-2013 11:28	-						
	readme.txt	16-Oct-2013 10:50	3.6K						
 Apo	ache/2.2.3 (CentOS) Server at	t www.dcs.gla.ac.uk Por	t 80						





# When I was younger, my mother did things to annoy me





SR: *simple* constraint model, *enumerated* domains SRB: *simple* constraint model, *bound* domains SRN: *specialised* n-ary constraint, *enumerated* domains

# 10 < n < 100: read, build, find all stable matchings



milliseconds

100 < n < 1000: read, build, find all stable matchings



# This is new (so says Rob and David)

n	cpu time	nodes	matched	max matchings
100	0.423	4 (17)	0.63	9
200	0.511	6(34)	0.52	16
300	0.645	7 (33)	0.53	16
400	0.768	7 (25)	0.38	10
500	0.950	7 (35)	0.45	16
600	1.094	7(27)	0.41	14
700	1.290	7 (31)	0.42	12
800	1.555	8(50)	0.44	24
900	1.786	8 (29)	0.39	12
1,000	2.046	8 (85)	0.40	40

n, average run time, nodes (maximum), proportion with matchings, maximum number of matchings



Well, think on this ...

There are hard variants of SR. One example is egalitarian SR where a matching is to be found that minimizes the sum of the ranks, and this has been shown to be NP-hard [9]. In our constraint model an egalitarian matching is one that minimizes  $\sum a_i$ . Therefore we can model this problem by adding one more variable (totalCost), one more constraint (totalCost =  $\sum a_i$ ) and a change from solving to minimization (line 36 of Listing 1). Naively, to find an egalitarian matching we could consider all matchings. As we see from Table 2 no instance had more than 40 matchings, no search took more than 85 nodes and the longest run time (not tabulated) was 2.6 seconds. Therefore, although NP-hard we would fail to encounter a hard instance in the problems sampled. So, (as Cheeseman, Kanefsky and Taylor famously asked [3]) where are the hard problems? As yet I do not know. Prove that the model finds a stable matching in quadratic time ...

This was all my own work ...

![](_page_68_Picture_1.jpeg)

... well, with some help from

David Manlove Rob Irving, Jeremy Singer Ian Gent Chris Unsworth Stephan Mertens Ciaran McCreesh Paul Cockshott Joe Sventek Augustine Kwanashie Andrea

![](_page_69_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_0.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_3.jpeg)

# ALGORITHMICS OF MATCHING UNDER PREFERENCES

![](_page_70_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_10.jpeg)

Foundations of Computing Series

The Stable Marriage Problem Structure and Algorithms

Dan Gusfield and Robert W. Irving

![](_page_70_Picture_14.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_15.jpeg)